

Marists after Vatican II /Maristes après Vatican II

Marists at Vatican II

Alois Greiler SM

In 1959 Pope John XXIII announced a Council. 50 years later we recall the Marists present at this epoch-making event. Literature on Vatican II usually highlights the protagonists. To look at the contribution of the small group of Marists (SM) opens a different perspective and forms an important memory for the Society of Mary.¹

1 Marists at Vatican II (1962-1965)

Full participation at Vatican II was limited to bishops and Superior Generals. Joseph Buckley, Bishops Darmancier, Julliard, Lemay, Mangers, Martin, Pearce, Rodgers, and Stuyvenberg came to all sessions. Bresson and Poncet were absent during the first, and Foley during the third, session.² Jean-Marie Aubin (1882-1967; France; Solomons) excused himself because of illness. Two other bishops died shortly before the Council began: Joseph-Félix Blanc (1872-8.6.1962; France; Tonga) and Joseph Darnand (1879-1.6.1962; France; Samoa).³

Jakob Mangers (1889-1972) was bishop of Oslo from 1953 to 1964. Norway counted less than 1% Catholics.⁴ The Scandinavian bishops joined the influential group of German-speaking bishops.⁵ The other Marist bishops worked in Oceania. Édouard Bresson (France; 1884-

¹ This is an excerpt from a broader dossier put together in German in 2005.

² Cf. *Acta Synodalia*, TPV (= AS), *Indices*, 'Interfuerunt'.

³ Aubin, Solomons, was sick; Cf. *Societas Mariae, Provincia Oceaniae, In memoriam*, Suva, Fiji, 2001, 188, and *Acta SM 7* (1963-1967), 36. 559-561. Blanc came to Tonga in 1901 and became bishop in 1912 (*In memoriam*, 131). Darnand came to Samoa in 1905 and became bishop in 1920 (until 1953) (*In memoriam*, 127; *Acta SM 7* (1963-1967), 36.525-526).

⁴ *Acta SM 6* (1960-1962), 557-559, has a picture of the Marist participants. Mangers, born in Luxembourg, joined the Society in France. In 1925 he came to Norway, becoming vicar apostolic in 1932; Cf. *Totenbuch der Deutschen Provinz der SM*. His Lenten pastoral of 2 February 1962 already presents his ecumenical and pastoral ideas on Vatican II; Cf. *Hyrdebrev for fasten 1962*, in *Kirkelige Kunngjöringer for Oslo Katolske Bispedømme*, diocesan archive, Oslo.

⁵ See R. M. Wiltgen, *The Rhine Flows into the Tiber*, Chawleigh, 1978.

1967) was vicar apostolic of New Caledonia from 1937.⁶ Pierre Martin (France; 1910-87), his successor, had been provincial of Lyon and became Apostolic Vicar in 1956, and then first archbishop of Noumea in 1966. Like Darmancier, he belonged to the group 'Church of the Poor'.⁷ Alexandre Poncet (France; 1884-1973) was an exegete. In 1925 he came to Wallis and was Vicar Apostolic from 1935 to 1960.⁸ Michel Darmancier (France; 1918-84), successor to Poncet, was a moral theologian and became Bishop of Wallis and Futuna in 1962 (until 1974).⁹ He was involved in ecumenical work.¹⁰ Victor Foley (England; 1909-87) became Vicar Apostolic of Fiji in 1944 and the first Archbishop of Suva in 1966.¹¹ Louis Julliard (France; 1912-84) became vicar apostolic of Port-Vila in 1955 (until 1977).¹² George Pearce (USA; *1921) became Vicar Apostolic of Apia (1956-67).¹³ Pearce then moved to Fiji (1968-76). John Hubert Rodgers (New Zealand; 1915-97) became Vicar Apostolic of Tonga and Niue in 1953.¹⁴ Daniel Stuyvenberg (1909-89) was appointed Vicar Apostolic of the South

⁶ *In memoriam*, 94, and necrology in *Acta SM* 7 (1963-1967), 36. 557-558. Bresson supported Catholic education and Catholic Action; G. Delbos, *L'Église catholique en Nouvelle-Calédonie*, Paris, 1993, 381-402.

⁷ *In memoriam*, 79-80; *Acta SM* 8 (1968), 3; D. Pelletier, *Une marginalité engagée: le groupe "Jésus, l'Église et les pauvres"*, in M. Lamberigts, Cl. Soetens, J. Grootaers (ed.), *Les commissions conciliaires à Vatican II*, Leuven, 1996, 67. Martin's Lenten Pastoral of 1962 welcomed the Council discussing new approaches in pastoral work; Delbos, *L'Église catholique*, 403-409. In 1970 he stepped back and returned to France in 1978.

⁸ Poncet: *In memoriam*, 208-209. One of his studentds was Cardinal Villot who left the Marist novitiate for health reasons; A. Wenger, *Le Cardinal Villot (1905-1979)*, Paris, 1989, 9.

⁹ J. J. Murphy, 'Up to Jerusalem': Australian Bishops' Suggestions for the Agenda of Vatican II, in *The Australasian Catholic Record* 78, 1 (2001), 30-45 (p. 33 'Wallace und Fortuna'!).

¹⁰ *In memoriam*, 217-218. Cf. G. Delbos, *L'Église catholique*, 410.

¹¹ Letter from Archbishop Petero Mataca, 5 July 1996, to present author: no documents by Foley on Vatican II in the Suva diocesan archives.

¹² *In memoriam*, 47; Letter from A. Verbraeken SM, 26 June 1996, to the present author, no documents by Julliard in Port-Vila.

¹³ Pearce: *Acta SM* 8 (1968), 3; *Marist Missions* 25 (1997) 1-2. He returned to the US and has not kept documents concerning the Council.

¹⁴ *Marist Missions* 25 (1997), 4; *In memoriam*, 17-18. Letter of the Sisters from 24 June 1996, Rodgers had not kept documents from the Council. See D. W. Mullins SM, *A Man with a Mission. Bishop John Rodgers SM of Tonga 1941-1972*, Auckland, Catholic Publication Centre, 1998, for a biography.

Solomons in 1958 (until 1985).¹⁵ Thomas Wade (USA; 1893-1969) became the first Bishop of the North Solomons in 1930.¹⁶ Leo Lemay (USA; 1909-1983) became provincial of Oceania in 1954 and in 1960 Bishop of Bougainville.¹⁷ Joseph Walter Buckley (1905-81), the seventh Superior General (1961-69),¹⁸ had mainly taught at Marist College, Washington, D.C., and the regional seminary of New Orleans (1934-59), and was Provincial of Washington from 1959 to 1961 and from 1970 to 1972, before and after his term as General.

Theologians exercised great influence on the Council as periti or experts. Marist theologians were periti to their confrere bishops. Buckley had named two of his assistants, Franz Wieschemeyer (1896-1991) and James Lambert (1913-92). Two Marist periti came from Oceania, Louis Beauchemin (USA; 1904-92, Samoa), expert in ecumenism, and Jean Soury-Lavergne (1904-80), Vicar General in New Caledonia.¹⁹ Two French Marists were important periti on the conciliar level, Villain and de Baciocchi. Maurice Villain (1900-77) had taught Church History and Ecclesiology and had been free for ecumenical

¹⁵ *In memoriam*, 229-230.

¹⁶ *In memoriam*, 133; cf. Necrology in *Acta SM* 9 (1969), 44. 496-499, with the funeral homily by Cardinal Cushing, Boston, who supported the Pacific missions.

¹⁷ Lemay: *In memoriam*, 201-202; *Acta SM* 6 (1960-1962), 110.

¹⁸ Born in the USA, professed in 1925, studied at the Catholic University of Washington, D.C., and the Angelicum in Rome (doctorate in 1931). Ordained a priest in 1931. Cf. APM, Fonds Buckley. According to a letter from V. A. Becker SM, Washington, D.C., none of his Council documents are in their archives.

¹⁹ Cf. Fonds Buckley (Wieschemeyer and Lambert); Fax Theo Koster SM, Fiji, 24 May 1996 (for Beauchemin and Soury-Lavergne). Beauchemin did not come to Rome. Soury-Lavergne was born in Noumea in 1904 of a French family. He made profession in 1925 and was ordained in Rome in 1932. He taught philosophy in France before leaving for New Caledonia in 1938. He died on 3 December 1980. Cf. *Intercom* (1981), 8; *In memoriam*, 264. Letter de Baciocchi to the author, 4 July 1997, says that Jean Coste SM (1926-94) was peritus for Julliard but Coste had too many other things to do. Coste followed the Council with great interest and said in a letter to relatives (5.1.1966) how impressed he was with the faith and engagement of the participants all these years; APM, Dossier Coste. The *Index Peritorum* of the *Acta Synodalia* (AS) does not mention the Marists. Wieschemeyer visited German bishops to discuss matters concerning the Society working in their diocese, so for example Simon Konrad Landersdorfer (Passau, Fonds Landersdorfer, 'Diarium 1957-63') and Helmut Hermann Wittler (Osnabrück, Fonds Wittler, council diary).

work since 1948.²⁰ With Paul Couturier, Lyon, he promoted ‘spiritual ecumenism’.²¹ He was the peritus for Martin and wrote for the journal *Rythmes du monde*.²² The Council diary of Yves Congar OP testifies to Villain’s important ecumenical contribution to Vatican II.²³ Joseph de Baciocchi (1915-2009) came as peritus for Darmancier, Martin and Julliard.²⁴ All Council periti co-operated and thus the precise influence of an individual theologian is difficult to trace back.²⁵

Australian Marist Stanley Hosie (*1922) was present as journalist. In 1965 his reports from the Council were honoured with prizes in Australia and the USA.

Bishops Victor Reed (Oklahoma and Tulsa, USA, a cousin of Buckley), Charles Buswell (Pueblo, USA), and Louis Caillouet (New Orleans, a friend of Buckley) also lived in the General house. Buckley’s

²⁰ Cf. M. Villain, *Vers l'unité. Itinéraire d'un pionnier, 1935-1975*, Dinard, 1986. P. Gauthier, *Les pauvres, Jesus et l'église*, Paris, 1962, mentions how Villain was moved by world poverty on return from the world conference of churches in New Dehli (November 1961). He wrote the Council chronicle ‘Œcuménisme’ in *Rythmes du Monde. History 3*, p. 165, note 151, lists him as ‘bishop’.

²¹ Couturier (1881-1953), diocesan priest; *Œcuménisme spirituel. Les écrits de l'abbé Paul Couturier*, edited by M. Villain, preface by Patriarch Maximos IV., Tournai, 1962; M. Villain, A. Latreille, *L'abbé Paul Couturier. Apôtre de l'unité chrétienne. Souvenirs et documents*, Tournai, ⁴1964. R. Girault, *The Reception of Ecumenism*, in G. Alberigo, J.-P. Jossua, J.A. Komonchak (ed.), *The Reception of Vatican II*, 1987 (1985), 137–167, p. 138.

²² See Villain, *Vers l'unité*, and M. Villain, L. Strijckman, E. De Saussure, *Introduction à l'œcuménisme*, Tournai, 3., rev. edition, 1961. From the generalate Villain could easily walk to Salvator Mundi where Maximos IV. Saigh resided. Cf. M. Villain, *Vatican II et le dialogue œcuménique*, Tournai, 1966, 29.

²³ Y. Congar, *Mon Journal du Concile*, Paris, 2002. Congar mentions Villain in the entries for 27 November 1962; 7 November 1963; 19 November 1964; 22 February 1965. Villain before the Council: G. Alberigo, J. A. Komonchak (ed.), *History of Vatican II*, Band 1, *Announcing and Preparing Vatican Council II. Toward a new Era in Catholicism*, Maryknoll - Leuven, 1995 (= *History*, 1), 83; Cf *Osservatore Romano. John Lawrence*, in *The Tablet* 8 January 2000, 29 – 30.

²⁴ De Baciocchi to the author, letter from 4 July 1997. Many of his documents are lost. In the Dutch *Concilium Oecumenicum Vaticanum II* two of his articles on Vatican II were printed: *Id.*, *De Concilievaarders en de rol van de paus op een Concilie*, in *ibid.*, 1 (1963) 130-132, and *Id.*, *Waarom nog een Concilie?*, in *ibid.*, 153-154 (both originally in *Catechistes*, 1.4.1962). De Baciocchi had a key influence in the new theology on marriage and the Eucharist before the Council. See E. Schillebeeckx, *Die eucharistische Gegenwart. Zur Diskussion über die Realpräsenz*, Düsseldorf, ²1968, 71f.

²⁵ De Baciocchi to the author, letter from 3 November 1997.

many invitations to the house created a centre of encounter and reflection parallel to others for the Council. This meant a lot of work for the four brothers with up to 25 guests for the evening meal.²⁶

1884 Council Fathers were diocesan bishops, 976 bishops were Religious, and 125 Superior Generals were also present.²⁷ How were the Marists involved in the Council?

2 The Marist vota of the pre-preparatory period (1959-1960)

The Council was prepared in two steps. In the pre-preparatory period future members could hand in *vota* or wishes for the agenda (*Commissio antepreparatoria* = CA).²⁸ This resulted in eight huge volumes with about 9000 proposals for 'everything and more'.²⁹ The Marist vota were pastorally orientated and open for reforms in the Church. Alcime Cyr (1882-1973; USA), Superior General before Vatican II (1947-61) focused his votum³⁰ on the Church and relationship clergy-religious. He proposed more ecumenical and missionary initiatives, a better formation of the clergy, and the vernacular in the liturgy.³¹ Mangers also favoured the vernacular (except the canon!), more ecumenism, and a reflection on the de-christianization in Europe.³² The official summary of the vota (*Conspectus*) left out the vota of Blanc (mainly on the reform of the liturgy³³) and Martin (more authority for the local bishop, vernacular in the liturgy³⁴). Pearce was the only Marist to opt for a new Marian

²⁶ Cf. *Acta SM* 6 (1960-1962) 557-559, and chronicle of the generalate in APM.

²⁷ *L'Osservatore Romano della Domenica*, Sonderheft Konzil 1966, 210.

²⁸ *History*, 1, 91-166; see also W. Ryder, *The Australian Bishop's Proposals for Vatican II*, in *Australasian Catholic Record* 65 (1988), 62-77. *Id.*, *Contribution of Bishops Goody and Archbishop Young to Ecclesiology of Vatican II*, in *Australasian Catholic Record* 65 (1988) 211-221. G. Butturini, *Missioni e concilio. Le istanze missionarie dei vescovi in vista del Vaticano II*, in G. Alberigo (ed.), *Il Vaticano II fra attese e celebrazione*, Bologna, 1995, 29-74, presents the vota of the missionary bishops – except Oceania.

²⁹ *Acta et Documenta Concilio oecumenico Vaticano II apparando; Series prima*, TPV, 1960-1961 (= ADA).

³⁰ ADA II, '8, Superiores generales religiosorum', 148-150; 5.9.1959. Cyr participated at the Roman Diocesan Synod; cf. *Acta SM* 6 (1960), 88; *History*, 1, 124, mentions his votum as 'open for reform'.

³¹ Cyr in the systematization of the vota, the *Conspectus: Pars I*, 35, *Pars I*, 255, *Pars II*, 122, *Pars II*, 351.

³² ADA II, 2, 'Europa', 637-638.

³³ ADA II, 7, 668-669.

³⁴ ADA II, 7, 627-628.

dogma ('Mediatrice of all graces'). His votum included reforms in Canon Law.³⁵ Poncet supported modern exegesis.³⁶ Most Marist references in the *Conspectus* refer to Rodgers.³⁷ He proposed to elect bishops like Superior Generals, unite similar religious congregations (also Cyr!) and to confer Minor Orders to catechists to strengthen their position. Foley expressed no special wishes.³⁸ Like 600 other bishops, Julliard, Wade and Stuyvenberg had not handed in any votum.

3 The preparatory period (1960-1962)

Initially it was not clear whether all Superior Generals would participate. The Pope decided in favour and Generals with more than a 1000 priests in their congregation were invited.³⁹ Buckley was on visitation and came back to Rome on 8 October to learn that on the 3rd he had been named member of Vatican II with full rights.⁴⁰

Only one Marist was a member of a preparatory commission, Jean Soury-Lavergne, as consultor for the Commission for the Missions, in Subcommission 2, *De Regimine missionum et de reformatione Codicis* [On directing missions and reform of canon law].⁴¹

The prepared texts were criticized by a majority of bishops and theologians, including de Baciocchi.⁴² Marists in Rome discussed the preparations,⁴³ also during the General Chapter of August 1961, which

³⁵ ADA II, 7, 666-668.

³⁶ ADA II, 7, 'America Meridionalis', 663-666; *Conspectus*, Pars I, 179 (eschatology). J. Murphy, 'Up to Jerusalem', praises Poncet's votum.

³⁷ ADA, II, 7, 661-662; partly translated in Mullins, *A Man with a Mission*, 115.

³⁸ ADA II, 7, 657, 17.8.1959.

³⁹ Documentation in *Acta et Documenta (Series Praeparatoria)*, TPV (= ADP), IV, 1. According to S. Fagan, *Les religieux au Synode - Religious at the Synod*, in *Acta SM 8* (1968), 50-67, the CIC did not foresee their participation but the Pope invited them at the proposal of William Slattery CM.

⁴⁰ Fonds Buckley, Felici to Buckley, 3 October 1962, Prot.Nr. 136 CV/62, 1 p., and chronicle (APM).

⁴¹ Cf. S. Paventi, *Entstehungsgeschichte des Schemas "De Activitate Misionali Ecclesiae"*, in J. Schütte (ed.), *Mission nach dem Konzil*, Mainz, 1967, 48-81; APM, house chronicle for 1961.

⁴² Villain, *Vatican II et le dialogue œcuménique*, 43-44 (Schema 'De fundamento ordinis christiani' which B. Häring called a 'monster'). Cf. *History*, 1, 410-429.

⁴³ APM, house chronicle for 1960: McKeefrey, archbishop of Wellington, Msgr. Herlihy, Rector of the Irish College, Rome; Cardinal Gilroy, Sydney, and other guests from Australia, Wallis and Futuna, New Caledonia and France; archbishop Young (Tasmania), Stuyvenberg (ad limina-visit), Hoban (Cleveland) with his auxiliary Krol, and archbishop M. Lefebvre (Dakar, Senegal). In 1961 came for

had an audience with John XIII on 1 September.⁴⁴ The first international congress on vocations in Rome in October 1961 saw Marists present, another moment in which to prepare for the Council. The General House was refurbished to accommodate all the guests.

4 Marist interventions during Vatican II⁴⁵

The first session, October – December 1962

Marist participants, about 15 Fathers and periti, lived in the General House, which eased economical problems that other bishops had. The first officially invited lay person to the Council was a member of the Marist Third Order, Jean Guitton (1901-99), who also visited the General House.⁴⁶ Guitton was a great friend of Paul VI.

A key event was the election of the Conciliar Commissions. Before, the Curia had dominated preparations. Now the bishops made it their Council. The famous interventions of Cardinals Liénart and Frings on 13 October were the result of many discussions,⁴⁷ also of a meeting in the Marist Generalate.⁴⁸ The Fathers of the South Pacific prepared the eventual elections in the Generalate. Martin and Buckley were named for the Commission on Education.⁴⁹ However, neither was elected.⁵⁰

example Delargey, auxiliary of Auckland, preparatory commission on the laity, John Patrick Cody, archbishop-coadjutor of New Orleans, Leo Binz, archbishop of St. Paul, USA, and again Krol, Philadelphia, and Gilroy, Sydney.

⁴⁴ ADP, I, 106-107. Cf. circular Buckley No 133 - VII, 1, 11 October 1961: "Papal Audience", and *Acta SM* 6 (1960-1962), 417. John XXIII spoke about the Council. Buckley spoke ten minutes with the Pope about simplicity and availability as core of the Marist charisms. To this John responded: „Adesso ci intendiamo“.

⁴⁵ The house chronicle does not mention the time between the sessions. The generalate was on the list to receive documents from the missionary congregations; Fonds Van Kerckhoven, Archive Leuven.

⁴⁶ J. Guitton, *Un siècle, une vie*, Paris, 1988, 68-72, on knowing the SM at Paris. *Ibid.*, 365. He: Guitton saw his ecumenical writings as reason for this invitation.

⁴⁷ Cf. M. Lamberigts, A. Greiler, *Concilium episcoporum est. The Interventions of Liénart and Frings Revisited, October 13th, 1962*, in *ETL* 73 (1997) 54-71, and G. Alberigo, J.A. Komonchak (Hg.), *History of Vatican II*, Band 2, *The Formation of the Council's Identity. First Period and Intersession, October 1962 - September 1963*, Maryknoll - Leuven, 1997 (= *History*, 2), 27-32.

⁴⁸ APM, chronicle for October 1962. This chronicle was not continued. De Baciocchi arrived only after these meetings; letter to the author, 3 November 1997.

⁴⁹ Diary Poncet, Fonds Poncet (copy in APM). The French Marists participated at the conferences of the French bishops. A copy of the revised list is in Fonds Martin, APM, but not mentioned in *AS. History*, 2, p. 74, note 22; cf. J. Brouwers, *Derniers préparatifs*, 355-358, on the elections as a turning point.

The first Marist to act in the Council hall (St Peter's basilica) was Mangers, presiding at the Eucharist on 30 October.⁵¹ Buckley was among those who proposed to change the *Ordo Concilii*.⁵² Three Marists addressed the Council.⁵³ Martin spoke on the sources of revelation. He proposed to give up the two-source theory – something the Council would ultimately decide. Darmancier spoke on the unity of the Church, emphasizing close links with the Eastern Churches. Buckley spoke during the debate on the Church in general, focussing on how to exercise authority and obedience, which he linked with the exercise of freedom. Therefore, the text on the Church may respect the freedom of the individual and be of an ecumenical orientation.⁵⁴

Like most fathers, other Marists could only hand in a written text.⁵⁵ Mangers wrote about ecumenism in Scandinavia, Darmancier about the 'confusion' concerning infallibility, and Martin on the Church as Mystical Body more than institution. The Marists handed in a common

⁵⁰ Buckley: AS I, 1, 77; Martin: AS I, 1, 66; Wade: AS I, 1, 66.

⁵¹ AS I, 1, 119.

⁵² ADP IV, 1, 361-362. In 1963 he repeated his postulata, *ibid.*, 379-380. Cf. Fonds conciliaire L.-J. Suenens (= FSuenens) 0620-0621 (L. Declerck, E. Louchez (ed.), *Inventaire des papiers conciliaires du cardinal L.-J. Suenens*, Louvain-la-Neuve, 1998) and FSuenens 0934, letter Suenens to Cardinal Lercaro, Bologna, 11 February 1963, on the revision of the *ordo concilii*, proposing Buckley as member.

⁵³ Martin: AS I, 3, 174-175, and 175 - 178; Darmancier: AS I, 3, 671-672; Buckley: AS I, 4, 353-355. G. Caprile, *Il primo periodo*, Rom, 1968, mentions Martin (171) Darmancier (221) and Buckley (256). Debates of the first session: *History*, 2. On 11 November, de Baciocchi and Martin had in the general house prepared a conference for the Marist bishops on the schema on revelation. They opted for a revision of the schema; diary Poncet, APM.

⁵⁴ V. A. Yzermans, *American Participation in the Second Vatican Council*, New York, 1967, 31, summarizes the essential points on the 'recent crisis in obedience in the Church' of Buckley's speech: "For many Catholics the crisis of obedience is not merely to obey or not to obey. For them the crisis of authority is a question of reason and method"; "Father Buckley's words struck at the very philosophic foundations of the Council"; *Ibid.*, 51-53, for an English translation. Opening words were „Authority and obedience are equally necessary. As a Superior General, I certainly do not want to diminish authority, ecclesiastical or any other legitimate authority"; Fonds Buckley, 4.12. Buckley sent a copy to Cardinal Lercaro, Bologna who thanked him in a letter from 7 December; Fonds Buckley.

⁵⁵ Mangers: AS I, 3, 804-805; Darmancier; AS I, 4, 451-453; Martin: AS I, 4, 531-532.

votum on the Missions on preaching the Gospel as the first and foremost task of the Church.⁵⁶

Buckley hosted many visitors and various theological conferences with speakers like Gustave Martelet SJ on Faith and on Christology (Villain, 'une cathédrale christologique').⁵⁷ The *Acta SM* speak of more than 100 guests during the first session, including bishops from dioceses where Marists were working. Periti like de Lubac SJ, Hans Küng, Lyonnet SJ, Roger Schutz and Max Thurian (Taizé) also came.

The second session, September – December 1963

The second session saw long debates on the church, the bishops, the laity, and ecumenism. Pearce (22.10.) and Martin (25.11.) enthroned the Gospel, the traditional symbol of the presence of Christ at a Council. Buckley wrote again on the reform of the agenda, wanting fewer general sessions, more time for commission work and 'open hearings'.⁵⁸

Four times a Marist held the microphone.⁵⁹ On 25 October Darmancier spoke on more tolerance in the Church, and one month later, on prayer for Christian unity, explicitly addressing non-Catholic observers. The latter speech reacted against a speech by Cardinal Florit according to whom a Catholic can outwardly say such a prayer but not out of a inner conviction.⁶⁰ Martin named Oceania as one place where

⁵⁶ 'Projet d'un appel du Concile œcuménique au monde entier, à examiner par NN. SS. les évêques présents à Monteverde, en vue d'être présenté à la commission pour les missions. - Projet préparé par Mgr Poncet. Proposition of an appeal by the Ecumenical Council to the whole world, to be examined by Their Lordships the Bishops now in Monteverde, in view of being presented to the Commission for the Missions. - Mgr Poncet prepared it', 3 p., Latin, APM, undated; Poncet was in Rome only for the first session.

⁵⁷ H. Denis, *Avec le Cardinal Gerlier et Monseigneur Villot: échos d'un compagnonnage*, in É. Fouilloux (ed.), *Vatican II commence ... Approches francophones*, Leuven, 1993, 133-145, here 136, and generalate chronicle.

⁵⁸ *ADP* IV, 1, 446-449 (October), 379-378 (November). He sent the October-speech to Villot, Council secretary, and influential cardinals like Lercaro, Döpfner and Frings; APM. Copies of the November-text are in Fonds Van Kerckhoven (Leuven), Hurley (Durban), Hoffer (Rome) and FSuenens 1400.

⁵⁹Darmancier: *AS* II, 3, 358-359 (oral) and 359-361 (written); cf. G. Caprile, *Secondo periodo*, Rome, 1966, 138; *AS* II, 6, 42-43; Martin: *AS* II, 6, 46-49, with 13 signatures.

⁶⁰ A. Wenger, *Vatican II. Chronique de la deuxième session*, Paris, 1964, 199.

lack of unity among Christians causes scandal.⁶¹ On 3 December Jean Guittou pleaded for more ecumenism.⁶²

Other Marists handed in written texts⁶³ and signed speeches and written texts of speakers who opted for more reforms.⁶⁴ In a statement, Villain appreciated the schema on unity but pointed to elements lacking, focusing on a theological deepening of the prayer for unity in the spirit of John, Chapter 17.⁶⁵ The Argentinian bishops mentioned Villain on ecumenism in the Church in their written votum.⁶⁶

The session concluded with the promulgation of the Constitution on the Liturgy and the Decree on Communication Media. In the inter-session Buckley sent in proposals to enhance the work of the Council and proposals on reforming the Curia.⁶⁷

The third session, September – November 1964

⁶¹ J.A.Brouwers, *Vreugde en hoopvolle verwachting*, Baarn, 1989, 99, quotes his sentence that it will be the poor who judge the Church now and at the end of time.

⁶² Guittou, *Un siècle, une vie*, 386.

⁶³ Julliard: AS II, 3, 491-493; Martin: AS II, 4, 685-686; Pearce: AS II, 2, 834-835; Poncet: AS II, 1, 700-701.

⁶⁴ Like for Garrone (Church as people of God – Darmancier, Julliard, Martin), J. P. Caroll, auxiliary of Sydney (Lemay, Pearce, Stuyvenberg) and Jean Weber, Straßburg (Darmancier, Julliard, Martin). Buckley, Lemay and Mangers were among the 'Plurimorum Patrum Postulata' (AS II, 2, 355-359) on religious in the schema on the Church. Darmancier signed a postulatum by Martin. Foley (with the bishops of England and Wales on the Marian chapter) and Pearce (Leven, Texas) supported fellow countrymen. Mangers signed for his coadjutor Gran on ecumenism and for postulata by Döpfner and Hengsbach (both Germany).

⁶⁵ Villain, *Vatican II et le dialogue œcuménique*, 93-99. In *Rythmes du Monde. Le bulletin des missions* 38 (1964) 54-64, he calls the 18 of November, 1963, 'une grande date historique!', as this debate indicates a shift in Church mentality – the Church now enters the dialogue with other churches to seek unity.

⁶⁶ AS II, 5, 912-918, here 912 and 915. On the problem of Scripture and tradition see J. Ratzinger, *Tradition, III. Systematisch*, in *LThK²*, vol. 10, col. 293-299.

⁶⁷ FSuenens: 'Modum in Concilio Oecumenico Vaticano II procedendi', 31 January 1964, 4 pages (No 1753); 'Memorandum quoad ordinem in Concilio Vaticano II observandum', 5 pages (No 1754); 'Memorandum on Parliamentary Procedure at Ecumenical Council Vatican II', 24 January 1964, 4 pages (No 1769), with 'Adnotationes super modo procedendi in Concilio Oecumenico Vaticano II', 31 January 1964, 4 pages (No 1770, = 1753); and 'Memorandum on Catholic Church Government', 24 January 1964, 7 pages (No 2002), 'Adnotationes super Ecclesiae regimine', 31 January 1964, 7 pages (No 2003). He sent it to the secretary general, Felici, on 1 April 1964. On 5 February 1964, Felici wrote to Buckley asking him to comment *De ecclesia*; Prot. E/2241, Fonds Buckley.

The wish to bring the Council to an end speeded up the work and shortened procedures and documents.

Buckley was the only Marist to speak. On 24 September he addressed religious liberty, a hot issue at the Council. Buckley opted for a text affirming the right to follow one's conscience, in particular in religious matters. The Council hopefully will not dissappoint the world!⁶⁸

On 11 November, in the name of 130 Fathers, Buckley spoke on religious life. For him, the text reflected developments until 1950 but had three lacunas. A word on friendship between diocesan and religious clergy is missing. There are no 'second class religious' and thus the distinction order – congregation may be lifted. Finally, he is grateful that Superior Generals with more than 1000 priests were admitted – but there are Generals who still have more priests in their congregation than many bishops in their diocese. Religious life is too monastic. The present crisis of authority is a crisis of the Superiors – not of their subjects! The new text recommended a Superior to listen to his council. However, many superiors have no experience with this. Colin, the Marist founder, had already instructed Superiors to listen to their Councilors.⁶⁹ Like the majority, Buckley rejected the text under debate.

The Oceanian Marists handed in a votum on the vocation of the priest: a missionary, in co-operation with the laity, sent in particular to

⁶⁸ AS III, 2, 493-494 (Intervention), 494-495 (written version), 4 September 1964; G. Caprile, *Terzo periodo*, Rom, 1966, 58; Yzermans, *American Participation*, 647-648; F. Anderson, *Council Daybook Vatican II, Session 3*, Washington, D.C., 1965, 43-46.48; G. Alberigo, J.A. Komonchak (ed.), *History of Vatican II*, vol. 4, *Church as Communion. Third Period and Intersession, September 1964-September 1965*, Maryknoll - Leuven, 2002 (= *History*, 4), 127.

⁶⁹ Buckley: AS III, 7, 464-466; *History* 4, 367; *History* 4, 368, says Hoffer, superior general of the Marianists, disputed the distinction between active and contemplative life – a reaction to Buckley?; Yzermans, *American Participation*, 437-438 (english text); Anderson, *Session 3*, 255-256 (summary) and 258 (english text); X. Rynne, *The Third Session*, New York, 1965, 209-214, calls the speech "particularly outstanding". Huyghe, France (AS III, 7, 472-473) supported Döpfner, Suenens, Bea, Charue, and Buckley: The schema is not sufficient. Speakers had distributed copies of their text. Buckley's intervention on the schema on religious life can be found in the Fonds Hurley, Van Kerckhoven and FSuenens 2124. FSuenens 2142 has a petition of contemplative orders (J. Prou, Solesmes, et alia) writing against lifting the distinction between orders and congregations – a reaction against Buckley? On superiors listening to their council: J. Coste, *L'attitude du supérieur en conseil*, in *Id.*, *Études sur les premières idées de Jean-Claude Colin - I*, Rome, 1989, 61-147.

the poor' to preach the gospel as 'testis Christi'.⁷⁰ Buckley wrote on more collegiality in the Church,⁷¹ on religious liberty and the role of bishops. Care for souls is a supernatural aim but is also to be seen in the light of psychology and correct theology.⁷² Darmancier handed in two vota on the laity, of which one (supported by Martin, Julliard and Buckley) highlighted the formation of lay people as apostles.⁷³ Pearce also wrote on the laity, referring to Colin and his respect for the desire for freedom in modern people.⁷⁴ Poncet excused himself because of his age and sent a votum with two points. Why does the Declaration on Religious Liberty not include Buddhists and other religious denominations? And - the document on Mission lacks the missionary dimension of the whole Church.⁷⁵ Lemay wrote in favour of religious liberty, and Martin repeated his previous proposals on the reform of the liturgy and more authority for the bishops. Again we find their names signing the vota of other Council Fathers.⁷⁶ The Superior Generals rejected the text on Religious; Buckley participated in their meeting on how to act during the Council.⁷⁷

De Baciocchi assisted among other Commission work in the 'atelier français du schéma XIII, section De matrimonio et familia', drafting proposals for amendments together with H. Féret OP, for 10 October 1964.⁷⁸ The text was to be less moralizing and more positive and biblical, looking on marriage as love between partners.⁷⁹ Villain was one of the Catholic delegates to the important Panorthodox Conference on Rhodos (November 1964).⁸⁰

⁷⁰ AS III, 4, 663-664 'Quidam PP. Conciliares Oceaniae': Julliard, Martin, Darmancier, Lemay, Stuyvenberg, Pearce.

⁷¹ Buckley: AS III, 1, 563-569.

⁷² Buckley: AS III, 2, 815-816 (ecumenism).

⁷³ Darmancier: AS III, 4, 294; AS III, 4, 804 (quote).

⁷⁴ Pearce: AS III, 4, 357-359, quote on page 358.

⁷⁵ Poncet: AS III, 2, 872-873 (ecumenism); AS III, 2, 887-888 (ecumenism); AS III, 3, 866-867 (revelation); AS III, 4, 749 (laity); AS III, 6, 804-806 (mission).

⁷⁶ Marists supported for example Beck, Liverpool, on the decree on education (Darmancier, Julliard, Lemay, Martin, Mangers, Pearce, Rodgers, Stuyvenberg, Wade), AS III, 8, 380-382, and Becks' written intervention on ecumenism, as well as the speeches on seminaries by Schmitt and Escuin. Darmancier's written text concerning the laity text was signed by Julliard, Mangers, Buckley.

⁷⁷ Wiltgen, *The Rhine Flows into the Tiber*, 216.

⁷⁸ FSuenens 2240, 'De ecclesia in mundo huius temporis. No 21: Dignitas matrimonii et familiae, Projét de texte remanié', 10 October 1964, 13 pages.

⁷⁹ Lemay: AS III, 2, 713-716; Martin: AS III, 3, 565-566.

⁸⁰ A. Wenger, *Vatican II. Chronique de la troisième session*, Paris, 1965, 274-278.

In October 1964, a Marist congress brought Buckley, Cento, Gerlier, Feltin, Guitton and Marists from Oceania to Lyon.⁸¹ The congress touched on conciliar themes like pastoral ministry and education.

The Generalate was humming again with visitors, including alumni of Marist schools and bishops who had Marists in their diocese.⁸²

The fourth session, September – December 1965

The last session had the least Marist interventions. Nobody spoke, few handed in a written text. Buckley was listed as speaker but the agenda was rearranged. He wrote on Mission - about former foreign missionaries travelling by sea to far-away countries to spend their whole life there... This alludes to early Marists going to Oceania! He said times have changed. Lay people may be called to short-term missionary involvement. More important than distances is openness of heart for Mission.⁸³ Darmancier wanted to make the same text more biblical,⁸⁴ and Poncet stressed ‘all are missionaries’.⁸⁵

⁸¹ Fonds Buckley; *Congrès international mariste*, Lyon 1964, Lyon, 1965.

⁸² The lists in APM illustrate the internationality of the fathers invited to the generalate (day/month): Frey (19/10), Joseph Urtasun (21/10), Casimiro Morcillo (Madrid) and P. Anastasio de SS. Rosario OCD (26/10), Cardinal Landazuri Ricketts (14/10), Cardinal Paolo Marella (22/9), Patrick O’Boyle (18/9), André Marie Charue (19/10), José Garibi y Rivera (Guadalajara, 18/10), François Kerveadou (Séminaire Français, 17/10), Feeney, Joseph T. McGucken (16/10), Stephen A. Leven (17/9), Cardinal Joseph E. Ritter (6/10); “Bishops Invited For Tuesday, October 27”: Cardinal José Garibi y Rivera; Archbishop Garrone; Archbishop Thiandoum, Dakar; Archbishop McGucken, San Francisco; Archbishop Maurice Roy, Quebec; Bishop Daniel J. Feeney, Portland; Joseph H. Hodges, Wheeling; William T. McDonald, Catholic University of America; François Kerveadou, St Briec et Tréguier; “Bishops Invited For Thursday, October 29”: Charue; Guibert (de La Réunion); John J. Russel (Richmond); Joseph M. Pernicone (New York); Jeremiah F. Minihan (Boston); Marius Paré (Canada); Oddone Tacoli (Vatican); Paul Marcinkus (Vatican). Suenens was invited for 10 November and Döpfner for 29 November. Invited were the former Marist pupils Cazeaux and Villot and Jenny and Bejot as residents Paris 104. other general houses acted in a similar way, see for example the house chronicle *Salvator Mundi*, RG 1435.4 (I thank Sister Grace Mary for the information). In their house were up to 26 council fathers. APM keeps also the plan for the menu!

⁸³ Buckley: AS IV, 4, 451-452; FSuenens 2582-2583, letter from 8 October 1965 and ‘Memorandum quoad schema decreti De Activitate missionali Ecclesiae’, 3 pages. The intervention of Suenens, 12 October 1965, AS IV, 4, 178 - 181, has no allusions to this memorandum.

⁸⁴ Darmancier: AS IV, 4, 475-476.

⁸⁵ Poncet: AS IV, 3, 892-893 (AG); AS IV, 1, 828-829 (DH).

The Commission for Religious discussed the question of ordaining Brothers to priests – supported by some Marist Brothers.⁸⁶

Cardinal Suenens led a conference on how to implement the Council, during which Buckley spoke about ‘authority’, reacting to criticism his intervention in the hall had caused. He had not intended to do away with obedience rather to give it a new perspective. Obedience has to do with personal maturity, freedom, social relationships, and Christ.⁸⁷ In December, the mid-chapter assembly allowed many Marists to experience the conclusion of Vatican II. The signatures of the fathers sealed the work of the four sessions of the Council.⁸⁸

5 Brief evaluation of the Marist contribution to Vatican II

The broad majority to bring about the conciliar reforms often consisted in unknown people like the Marist. And it was their role as bishops rather than their role as Religious which gave them the right to vote. The presence and importance of Religious at Vatican II are often neglected.⁸⁹

From the vota to their conciliar interventions, the Marists appear as homogenous in supporting reforms in order to respond to pastoral needs. Their vota were less on doctrinal issues and echoed the three major trends of all vota: bishops, deaconate, and liturgy. Only one other major topic was missing – Mariology!⁹⁰ What helped them in their work was the good networking. The French Marists joined the strong

⁸⁶ G. Alberigo – J. Komonchak (eds.), *History of Vatican II*, volume 5, Maryknoll – Leuven, Orbis – Peeters, 2006, p. 187-188. See Brambila-Article!

⁸⁷ FBuckley, “Private Record of Discussions on Conciliar Themes held at the Villa Miani, Rome, during the Last Session of the Second Vatican Council; Held at the invitation and sponsorship of His Eminence, Léon Joseph Cardinal Suenens, Archbishop of Malines - Brussels, Fall, 1965”; Cf Circular Letter N. 141-VII, 9, 25 January 1966, for the Marist assembly between the 1961 and 1969 chapter.

⁸⁸ Martin signed as representative of Bresson: AS IV, 6, 684; AS IV, 7, 856.

⁸⁹ The Church counted 300.000 religious men and 1.200.000 religious women at the time! Buckley said in a conference concerning the episcopal synod 1967: “In giving the consultative meeting which the Holy Father convened in Rome for the past month of October its official title ‘Synod of Bishops’, I do so with some measure of discontent, because, after all, I too, although not a bishop, was a member of the Synod - and with me nine other superiors general of religious communities. One of the best kept secrets of the Ecumenical Council, Vatican II, was that there were present, with full voting and speaking rights, - signing officially each Council document, just like the bishops - some one hundred superiors general”; Fonds Buckley.

⁹⁰ *History*, 1, 112.

Francophon group and Mangers the German speakers. Hospitality in the General House supported this.

Direct impact of an individual bishop or peritus was less effective than collaboration with groups.⁹¹ The Marists supported ecumenism, religious liberty, Mission, and the new concept of Church. Others supported the Marist interventions. De Bacciochi sees one trace of his/their work in the change from ‘the Pope’, ‘Peter’, to ‘the Pope and the bishops’, ‘Peter and the other apostles’.⁹²

Marist participants argued on the basis of Scripture, pastoral experience, and Marist tradition. Their biographies show that they remained positive about the Council.⁹³ In 1967 Buckley was voted in as one of the ten Superior Generals for the Episcopal Synod – the Council had made him known.⁹⁴ In his circulars, Buckley favoured implementation, with the aim of renewal in the Church.⁹⁵

Many Marists felt that Vatican II confirmed their charism with ‘Mary in the Church’ when Vatican II decided to integrate a text on Mary in the Constitution on the Church.⁹⁶ Jean Coste did not say Colin

⁹¹ De Bacciochi sees the Marist bishops in favour of the reforms (liturgy, pastoral, mission); letter to the author, 3 November 1997. G. Arbuckle, *The Impact of Vatican II on Marists in Oceania*, in J. A. Boutilier, D. T. Hughes, S. W. Tiffany (ed.), *Mission, Church and Sects in Oceania*, Lanham - New York - London, 1978, 275-299, says this was remarkable in view of their euro-centrism.

⁹² De Bacciochi, letter to the author, 4 July 1997.

⁹³ Cf. G. Arbuckle, *The Impact of Vatican II on Marists*. For G. Delbos, *L'Église catholique en Nouvelle-Calédonie*, 405, Martin for example worked on implementing the decrees on bishops and priests (CD; PO).

⁹⁴ For Buckley at the synod see *Acta SM 7* (1963-1967), 445-448, and S. Fagan, *Les religieux au synode - Religious at the Synod*, in *Acta SM 8* (1968), 50-68.

⁹⁵ N. 142 - VII, 10, “The Decrees of the Council”, 19 March 1966. His circular N. 141 - VII, 9, 25 January 1966, spoke about education as Marist apostolate, on the conciliar decree GE and Catholic schools and on OT and priestly formation in the congregation. Buckley published an article on *Gaudium et Spes*: W. J. Buckley SM, *The Pastoral Constitution on the Church in Today's World. A Review for Relevance*, in J. Mikalik (ed.), *Theological Soundings. Notre Dame Jubilee Studies (1923-1973)*, New Orleans, 1973, 132-143.

⁹⁶ J. Coste, *Une certaine idée de la Société de Marie - Jean-Claude Colin*, Rome, 1990. On the Marist charism: C. Larkin, *Mary in the Church. The Basis of Marist Spirituality*, thesis, Rome, 1979. S. de Fiores, *Marie dans la théologie post conciliaire*, in R. Latourelle (ed.), *Vatican II. Bilan et perspectives. Vingt-cinq ans après (1962-1987)*, vol. 1, Paris, 1988, 469-533, describes the return of Mary out her isolation back into the Church and theology; Cf. S.M. Perella, *Maria di Nazareth nel mistero di Cristo e della Chiesa tra il Vaticano II e la Tertio Millennio adveniente (1959-1998)*, in *Marianum* 60, 153-154 (1998) 385-530.

prepared the Council but he saw a continuity between Colin and *Lumen gentium* No. 69.⁹⁷ Other Marist elements came up: respect for freedom, a serving and missionary Church. Pearce looked at the Council as an experience of the Holy Spirit – notwithstanding all the human weaknesses.⁹⁸ Villain drew a positive summary concerning ecumenism, religious liberty, theological dialogue among Christian churches, humility and spiritual ecumenism in the footsteps of Couturier.⁹⁹ The Society followed the Church in its changing attitude to the world, to religious life, in a ‘change of myths’ as Marist Arbuckle named it.¹⁰⁰

The great protagonists worked for pastoral reforms. Fathers like the Marists were less known but their pastoral experience and religious charism caused them to vote for these reforms. Without these votes, those may not have succeeded. The Marist participants put these decisions of a new Pentecost into practice in their local churches and in the Society of Mary. In his circular, Buckley called the document on the Church a treasure, in particular in view of the Marist charism:

“We know, too, that Father Colin loved to think of and to present the Holy Virgin in the midst of the apostles in the infant Church, a role she will continue throughout the whole history of the Church until the end of time. These considerations on the place and function of Mary in the mystery of salvation and of the Church fit perfectly into the pattern of Vatican II.”

⁹⁷ J. Coste, *Projet mariste initial et Eglise de Vatican II, in Rénovation adaptée de notre vie religieuse* (Document S.M., 34), Paris, 1967. *Ibid.*, in an article on *Perfectae caritatis*, Coste points to a rediscovery of the Marist charism independent from and earlier than PC 2.

⁹⁸ Pearce, letter to the author 16 July 1996. He kept only officially printed material from the Council.

⁹⁹ Villain, *Vatican II et le dialogue œcuménique*, 200. L. Cardinal Jaeger, *Das Konzilsdekret Über den Ökumenismus. Sein Werden, sein Inhalt, seine Bedeutung* (Konfessionskundliche und kontroverstheologische Studien, 13), Paderborn, 1968, 127, mentions Couturier who mentioned humility as path to unity – one aspect of Darmancier’s intervention in 1962. M. Villain, *Um das Dekret über den Ökumenismus*, in *Concilium* 2 (1966) 287-297, calls Jaeger’s commentary the best. Information on Villain in *Concilium* is not correct. Villain was Marist, not Marianist, and had studied at the Angelicum, not at San Anselmo. Villain saw decisive steps achieved and wished for a further maturation of the conciliar decree.

¹⁰⁰ G. A. Arbuckle SM, *Out of Chaos. Refounding Religious Congregations*, New York, Mahwah, London, Paulist Press, 1988: ‘Case study of Mythological Distortion: The Marists’, 71-76; 166-167; ‘Stages of Refounding the Marists within Oceania’, 173-183.